

Recommendations matrix

Action Taken on ESP improvement in accordance with recommendations Of Appraisal Report and GPE “Review of ESP and Appraisal Report”

#	Recommendations	Action as of August 30, 2013	Next steps
1.1	The composition of the LEG should be modified to bring it in line with the GPE guidelines, according to which it should include the DPG, civil society, the private sector, and think tanks, as part of a strategy to fully involve a wider range of stakeholders, especially at the decentralized level, and ideally including direct stakeholders (students, parents, teachers, administrators), in the peer review of the ESP, and to use their comments, feedback, as well as expertise, for the revision and implementation of the ESP.	New LEG list included: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trade Union on education, science and culture • Public Welfare Foundation of Uzbekistan “Mahala” • Chamber of Commerce and Industry • State Committee on Statistics • Ministry of Higher and Secondary Specialized Education • Ministry of Justice • Ministry of Labour and social protection of population • DPG members: UNICEF, UNESCO, WB, EU, British Council, GIZ 	Cabinet of Ministers approved the list
1.2	The ESP should be regarded as an evolving rather than a fixed plan, which can be revised or updated as and when needs or priorities change. As a principle, the quality of the ESP must be ensured regardless of the different purposes it might serve.	An annual review of ESP and Action Plan is incorporated in ESP summary	Completed
1.3	A communications and dissemination plan for ESP development and implementation should be prepared, taking into account any lessons learned from WIS I and II preparation, implementation and monitoring and evaluation processes (linked to the Monitoring and Evaluation	Communication and Dissemination Plan is prepared and incorporated in (Section 4.6)	Round table to be conducted on September, Regional Meetings on October – November Responsible: LEG

#	Recommendations	Action as of August 30, 2013	Next steps
	strategy – see Section 4.4 below).		
1.4	It is necessary to add an executive summary, as many of the stakeholders and interested parties would not be able to thoroughly analyze all 120 pages, which carry a lot of information.	An executive summary is added in ESP (section 1.1)	Completed
2.1	The CA/DPG/SE should advocate for the importance of an open and participatory dialogue that would allow the various stakeholders to contribute to the preparation and implementation of the ESP and the grant proposal, and ensure the full alignment of development assistance with country priorities.	Feedback from stakeholders is included in dissemination Plan	Round table to be conducted on September, Regional Meetings on October – November Responsible: LEG
2.2	Clarify the coordinating mechanisms between the LEG and DPG.	New membership of LEG includes more DPG members ensuring better communication. Coordinating mechanism from GPE Country Level Process Guide has been implemented	Completed
2.3	Clarify the role of local stakeholders (universities, civil society, NGOs) in supporting ESP implementation.	LEG include representatives of civil society and NGOs	Completed
3.1	Review and correct, as necessary, the data on financial resources, in particular the percentage of public expenditure on education	Data on financial resources have been corrected according to the data provided by MoF and other concerned ministries/agencies during UNESCO workshop in March 2013	Completed
3.2	Further improve the analysis of human resources by adding more detailed information on education personnel (for example teachers, administrators and managers): the number, their qualifications, their distribution (by geographical area and subject area), rate of attrition, the extent in-service or professional training provided, etc	More detailed information on education personnel has been produced and provided through the simulation model	Completed
3.3	Further improve the situation analysis by adding critical cross-cutting areas and the issues of inequality, efficiency, management and financing. In addition, adding a more	The content of the situation analysis has been rearranged to reflect more explicitly the cross-cutting issues such as management and	This recommendation will also considered in annual review 2014

#	Recommendations	Action as of August 30, 2013	Next steps
	comparative perspective on system performance, drawing on the experiences of other countries and a cost analysis, would greatly assist in the development of reference benchmarks for education development in Uzbekistan.	financing.	Responsible: LEG
3.4	Link this section more clearly with the outputs and outcomes in Section 4.2 and clearly identify the source of all 'policy' statements	Referencing of policy statements has been fixed when the situation analysis was reviewed and revised	Completed
3.5	Clarify the availability and suitability of data across all sub-sectors and the effectiveness of the current education management and information system, identifying areas for possible improvement (with DPG support as required)	Details of the sources of data used for the simulation model were provided in the revised Chapter 6.	Effectiveness of educational management system to be considered in 2014 annual review Responsible: LEG
3.6	Broaden the section on SEN to include all disadvantaged and vulnerable groups at all levels of education and highlight access as a cross-cutting issue for all sub-sectors.	Section 3.3.8 was broadened in accordance with information from 8 sub-groups to include information on gender, minority groups, children from low income families, children with special needs	Further information to be provided by Ministry of Health and Ministry of Labour and Social Protection (LEG, September 2013)
3.7	Describe measures to increase gender equity at senior high and tertiary levels	Information on activities being implemented in the country at the level of special secondary-professional, higher and adult education is incorporated in ESP (Section 3.3.3 and 3.3.5)	Completed
4.1.1	Establish clear sub-sector priorities in relation to national objectives, GoU/Ministry and DP strategic documents and the availability of future funding.	National priorities are described in section 4.1. each subsector highlighted priorities in their area in section 4.2	Availability of future funds to be provided by Ministry of Finance in 2014
4.1.2	Provide essential enrolment projection data to facilitate planning for the human and financial resource requirements arising from enrolment increases as well as decreases.	Data provided by the ministries, state statistics committee and MoF are all incorporated in ESP	To be further considered during annual review 2014

#	Recommendations	Action as of August 30, 2013	Next steps
4.2.1	Explore the lessons learned from previous interventions in each sub-sector.	Incorporated in section 3.6 Detailed Donor Mapping attached (Annex4)	Completed
4.2.2	Identify the priority areas based on which strategies and actions can be elaborated and clearly defined.	Priorities for each subsector identified and added in narrative part (chapter 4). Actions are included in Action Plan	Completed
4.2.3	Clarify implementation risks and constraints and identify mitigation strategies	Incorporated (section 4.7)	Completed
4.3.1	It is strongly recommended that the financial projections in the ESP are reviewed and revised. Using a simulation model based on cohort analysis can be very helpful in this respect as it can instantly produce projection results when a target or assumption is changed	A simulation model has been developed for Uzbekistan providing projection results on enrolment and the required budget as well as the funding gap	Adult education part to be completed (see 6.3.6) Responsible: Ministry of Labour and social protection (September, 2013)
4.3.2	The financing and costing part of the ESP should include information on recent trends in financing sources, capital expenditure, and the financing gap, disaggregated by sub-sector and by year. There is also a need to elaborate how GoU will address the financing gap if any. This information is critical for making the case for additional external resources, whether through GPE or other sources	A simulation model has been developed allowing the projection of financing gap for the ESP period	Completed
4.4.1	Clarify more precisely what kind of M&E system is envisaged, how it will be implemented, to what timescale and by whom, indicating human and financial resource implications, as well as priorities.	Chapter 5 of the ESP includes monitoring indicators. Mechanism of M&E was incorporated in ESP (section 5.2)	Completed. Chapter 5 includes reporting format and timescale
4.4.2	Explore the possible links to/lessons to be learned from WIS I and II implementation and monitoring processes	Lessons learned from Welfare Improvement strategy of Uzbekistan (WIS II) and National Programme of Personal Training were used in development of M&E mechanism in ESP	Completed
4.5.1	Further develop the Action Plan and clarify how, by whom	Detailed Action Plan is included in the ESP.	Completed

#	Recommendations	Action as of August 30, 2013	Next steps
	and by when it will be implemented and updated as necessary, including the annual 'action programming' process	Chapter 4 (section 4.4) revised to make outcomes and outputs more aligned with the actions/activities.	
5.1	The ESP implementation plan should take into account the capacity of the ministries concerned and ensure capacity-building measures are in place, especially when it involves different ministries and agencies. A comprehensive and long-term approach to capacity development is required (again linked to agreed DP strategies)	Incorporated into Section 4.5	To be further considered during annual review 2014
5.2	The ESP (as previously mentioned) should include a section on implementation which details the mechanisms and steps that will be put in place to ensure the effective implementation of the ESP	Included in Action Plan and incorporated in ESP	Annual joint sector review in 2014
6.1	As has already been mentioned, the ESP should include a strategy for ensuring effective support for ESP implementation, in particular with regard to the roles and responsibilities of the different ministries and levels of administration, including effective arrangements for communication and dissemination	Included in Action Plan (section 4.4) and incorporated in ESP	Completed
6.2	An accountability matrix appropriate for the Uzbekistan system also needs to be developed to promote transparency and effective monitoring.	Included in Action Plan and incorporated in ESP and section on monitoring (section 5.2)	Completed
7.1	The ESP should include a risk assessment of Uzbekistan's financial capacity to sustain education development priorities to take into account efficiency in spending and the high inflation rate. It should also include a risk assessment of implementation capacity taking into account the decentralization reforms	Risk assessment added in ESP (section 4.7)	Completed